



**TOWN OF BOXFORD**  
**Office of the Town Administrator**  
7A Spofford Road  
Boxford, MA 01921

**DATE:** December 23, 2022

**TO:** Board of Health

**FROM:** Waste Stream Task Force

**RE: Recommendations for Boxford's Municipal Refuse Contract with Waste Management**

On Wednesday, December 14<sup>th</sup>, Richard Taylor, Chair of the Boxford Board of Health ("BOH"), requested that the Waste Stream Task Force ("Task Force") make a series of recommendations to assist the BOH in advance of the January 4<sup>th</sup> meeting with representatives of Waste Management, the Town's current trash hauler. At that meeting, the BOH will determine whether or not to extend the Town's current contract with Waste Management, among other decisions.

The requests for information/recommendations from the BOH are listed below:

1. A summary table of contract options and projected costs per year for FY23-FY27
2. The Task Force position of automated pick up
3. The Task Force position on allowing one, no charge container for trash per week per household
4. The Task Force position on 'extra' trash exceeding the one container limit---if colored bags or stickers a range for the cost of each
5. Any suggestions for improvement of services, i.e., missed collections

This report and its accompanying recommendations address the five requests outlined by the BOH. Additionally, it is worth noting that, in order to compile the information below and present the best options for the consideration of the BOH, the Task Force met 5 times, including meetings with representatives of Waste Management and the Massachusetts Department of Environmental Protection ("MassDEP"). In addition to these meetings and ongoing communication with Waste Management throughout the past six months, the Town Administrator's office contacted nearby communities to learn more about how they provided waste management services and what they liked or did not like.

**Summary of Extension Offers and Recommendation of Task Force**

Throughout the months of back-and-forth negotiation between Waste Management and the Town, Waste Management ultimately presented six different pricing options: five under the current manual collection method, and one that would shift the Town to automated collection.

The figures listed below are the estimated costs for each relevant fiscal year within each of the six extension offers that Waste Management has presented to the Town. The “Estimated Additional Cost for Refuse Collection” is based off of an estimated amount of 1,922.27 tons of municipal waste disposed of by the Town annually, which is multiplied by the per-ton incremental municipal refuse disposal rate charged by Waste Management for each fiscal year of the various offers. The estimated recycling costs are based off of the roughly \$9 K in recycling expenses that the Town has incurred in the past 12 months, increasing proportionally based on Waste Management’s proposed increase in the per-ton recycling collection rate.

The actual extension offers from Waste Management are listed in *Appendix 1*.

**Manual Collection**

**1-Year Extension Offer (Manual Collection)**

	Base Rate	Estimated Additional Cost for Refuse Collection	Estimated Recycling Costs	TOTAL	% Increase vs. Prior Year
FY23 (Current Contract)	\$543,185.43	\$176,849.01	\$8,871.27	<b>\$728,905.71</b>	N/A
FY24	\$767,880.00	\$182,615.82	\$10,614.83	<b>\$961,110.65</b>	32%

**2-Year Extension Offer (Manual Collection)**

	Base Rate	Estimated Additional Cost for Refuse Collection	Estimated Recycling Costs	TOTAL	% Increase vs. Prior Year
FY23 (Current Contract)	\$543,185.43	\$176,849.01	\$8,871.27	<b>\$728,905.71</b>	N/A
FY24	\$725,220.00	\$182,615.82	\$10,614.83	<b>\$918,450.65</b>	26%
FY25	\$768,733.00	\$193,572.77	\$11,251.72	<b>\$973,557.49</b>	6%

**3-Year Extension Offer (Manual Collection)**

	Base Rate	Estimated Additional Cost for Refuse Collection	Estimated Recycling Costs	TOTAL	% Increase vs. Prior Year
FY23 (Current Contract)	\$543,185.43	\$176,849.01	\$8,871.27	<b>\$728,905.71</b>	N/A
FY24	\$699,624.00	\$182,615.82	\$10,614.83	<b>\$892,854.65</b>	22%
FY25	\$741,601.00	\$193,572.77	\$11,251.72	<b>\$946,425.49</b>	6%
FY26	\$786,097.00	\$204,568.17	\$11,927.13	<b>\$1,002,592.30</b>	6%

**4-Year Extension Offer (Manual Collection)**

	Base Rate	Estimated Additional Cost for Refuse Collection	Estimated Recycling Costs	TOTAL	% Increase vs. Prior Year
FY23 (Current Contract)	\$543,185.43	\$176,849.01	\$8,871.27	<b>\$728,905.71</b>	N/A
FY24	\$699,624.00	\$182,615.82	\$10,614.83	<b>\$892,854.65</b>	22%
FY25	\$741,601.00	\$193,572.77	\$11,251.72	<b>\$946,425.49</b>	6%
FY26	\$786,097.00	\$204,568.17	\$11,927.13	<b>\$1,002,592.30</b>	6%
FY27	\$848,985.00	\$220,926.70	\$12,881.68	<b>\$1,082,793.38</b>	8%

**5-Year Extension Offer (Manual Collection)**

	Base Rate	Estimated Additional Cost for Per Ton Refuse Collection	Assumed Recycling Costs	TOTAL	% Increase vs. Prior Year
FY23 (Current Contract)	\$543,185.43	\$176,849.01	\$8,871.27	<b>\$728,905.71</b>	N/A
FY24 (New Contract)	\$699,624.00	\$182,615.82	\$10,986.34	<b>\$893,226.17</b>	23%
FY25	\$741,601.00	\$193,572.77	\$11,645.53	<b>\$946,819.30</b>	6%
FY26	\$786,097.00	\$204,568.17	\$12,344.58	<b>\$1,003,009.75</b>	6%
FY27	\$841,124.00	\$218,889.09	\$13,208.84	<b>\$1,073,221.93</b>	7%
FY28	\$908,414.00	\$236,400.99	\$14,265.16	<b>\$1,159,080.15</b>	8%

**Automated Collection**

**5-Year Extension Offer (Automated Collection)**

	Base Rate	Estimated Additional Cost for Per Ton Refuse Collection	Assumed Recycling Costs	TOTAL	% Increase vs. Prior Year
FY23 (Current Contract)	\$543,185.43	\$176,849.01	\$8,871.27	<b>\$728,905.71</b>	N/A
FY24 (New Contract)	\$576,000.00	\$182,615.82	\$10,986.34	<b>\$769,602.17</b>	6%
FY25	\$601,920.00	\$190,843.15	\$11,425.80	<b>\$804,188.94</b>	4%
FY26	\$629,006.00	\$199,435.70	\$11,883.16	<b>\$840,324.86</b>	4%
FY27	\$666,740.00	\$211,411.45	\$12,358.42	<b>\$890,509.87</b>	6%
FY28	\$713,418.00	\$226,212.95	\$12,852.40	<b>\$952,483.34</b>	7%

Of note, **the automated collection method requires a one-time capital expense of \$290 K - \$330 K** (depending on the size of the barrels) **to purchase the standardized barrels** (both for trash and recycling) **required to operate the automated collection method.** This would require an appropriation to finance the cost of the barrels. Additionally, MassDEP offers grant funding to assist with the cost of financing the barrels; however, these grants are only available for communities that utilize containers that are 35-gallons or less (more information on this is outlined below). The estimated useful life of the barrels is fifteen years.

As the figure above demonstrate, even when factoring in the capital costs to purchase the barrels necessary for automated collection, **the five-year contract extension offer with an automated collection method is the most financially advantageous for the Town and it is the recommendation of the Task Force to either accept this offer or to request an offer from another hauler within these parameters.**

With regards to the potential of requesting competing offers from other haulers, Assistant Town Administrator Brendan Sweeney and BOH Member Alex Constan did speak with officials from West Newbury, who contract with G. Mello Disposal Corp. to collect their trash and recycling through an automated collection method. They have been pleased with the service and noted that as G. Mello retains ownership of the barrels, West Newbury did not have to pay any capital costs to purchase the barrels.

#### **Why the Task Force Recommends a Switch to Automated Collection**

As stated above, **the Task Force is in favor of moving the Town to an automated collection method.** Doing so would yield significant cost savings for the Town.

As noted above, the members of the Task Force spoke with a nearby community that has already made this transition (West Newbury); they noted that they have had no issues with regards to collection. Additionally, they stated that the standardized barrels are fairly easy to move up and down the driveway, even at the 64-gallon size, which is what West Newbury uses for trash and recycling.

There are other additional operational benefits that the Town would see from switching to an automated collection method. For example, as automated collection is less taxing on the hauler's workforce (and generally reduces the hauler's manpower requirements), there should be a reduction in driver/worker turnover. This will mean that drivers will be more familiar with their routes, reducing missed street collections. Additionally, as multiple industry professionals have confirmed, utilizing an automated collection method reduces worker injuries.

## Remaining Decisions

**If the BOH accepts the Task Force’s recommendations to move to an automated collection method under the contract proposal offered by Waste Management** (or to seek offers from other haulers under the same parameters), **there are still decision points that remain.** These decision points are:

- Whether or not to offer the standardized barrels required for automated collection “free of charge” or to assess usage fees
- The size of the standardized trash and recycling barrels
- Whether to offer an option to accommodate “overflow” trash and the price for the town-issued sticker or bag required to do so

There was not a unanimous consensus among the Task Force regarding the first bullet point of the above. However, after a lengthy discussion of the benefits and drawbacks, **a majority of the Task Force recommended allowing two (one for trash and one for recycling) no-charge containers per week per household.** Given the changes to the Town’s waste collection system that will already be taking place from a shift to an automated collection method, the members of the Task Force in favor of this approach advocated for reducing confusion that would result from instituting an annual usage fee for the service.

This approach would result in additional cost pressures to the Town budget, both from the +\$41 K increase in waste management costs from fiscal year (FY) 2023 to FY2024, as modeled in the table above, as well as the -\$320 K loss in revenue due to the abandonment of the current trash sticker system used for manual collection.

**With regards to the size of the container, there was again was a lack of consensus among the Task Force.** The debate was between whether to opt for a 35- or 64-gallon trash barrel and a 64- or 96-gallon recycling barrel. Specifically, with regards to the size of the trash barrel, the debate largely centered around whether to choose a 35-gallon barrel (the recommendation of MassDEP) and potentially disincentivize trash disposal in excess of the amount that the Town currently sees, while also qualifying for grant funding to defray the cost of the barrels (as mentioned above) or to choose a 64-gallon barrel that will accommodate the trash disposal needs of the large majority of the households in Boxford without the need for a second barrel. Conversation regarding the size of the recycling barrel centered around potential issues with the mobility of the larger barrel, particularly for elderly residents.

Waste Management will bring sample barrels to the January 4<sup>th</sup> meeting to assist the BOH in making a decision regarding container size.

For the third bullet-point, **the Task Force believes that there should be an option for disposal of “overflow” trash aside from the capacity of the standardized barrels.** The general consensus of the method for allowing overflow bags was to maintain some variation of the current usage of stickers. **A \$5**

**fee per bag/sticker was recommended**, which could help recoup anywhere from \$40 K - \$60 K of the lost \$320 K in trash sticker revenue under the Town's current manual collection method.

Finally, with regards to the issue of customer service, Waste Management recommended the following improvement to their service (through their representative, Roy Boyer), which the Task Force believes the BOH should consider:

Waste Management will provide Boxford residents with two options to report a missed pickup. The first option is an improvement on what is already offered: Town residents can call our 1-800 number to be connected with our call center. This approach removes Town officials from having to take these calls directly. A new, second option will be virtual communication through the Town's website. In this process, residents begin by answering a few questions, which will be reviewable by both Waste Management and the Town. The Waste Management representatives will take this information and generate a ticket to send to our dispatch team. This information will then be sent to the drivers in the field to recover any missed pickups. None of this information will be made public at any point in the process.

## **Appendix 1**

### Contract Extension Offers from Waste Management



December 12, 2022

Town of Boxford  
7A Spofford Road  
Boxford, MA 01921

**RE: “Extension of Agreement of the Collection and Disposal of Refuse and Recyclable Services Between Town of Boxford and Waste Management of Londonderry Inc.”**

Dear Brendan and Alex

Waste Management of Londonderry, Inc. (“WM”) is proud to be the Town of Boxford’s community’s service provider since 2018 and we are grateful for your business. WM is also proud of the essential work our frontline collection, recycling, and disposal crews performed throughout the COVID-19 pandemic and continue to provide your community despite lingering and difficult disruptions.

This letter will formally propose an extension of the current Collection and Disposal of Refuse and Recyclable Services Agreement between the Town of Boxford Ma and Waste Management of Londonderry Inc.

Waste Management of Londonderry Inc. proposes to offer the Town the following Options below as we discussed in exchange for a contract extension. **These rates will remain valid until January 6, 2023.**

**Manual Collection as it is being done today**

**One Year Option**

<b>Contract Period</b>	<b>Curbside Annual Collection Rate</b>	<b>Solid Waste Disposal Rate Per Ton</b>	<b>Processing Fee Per Ton</b>
July 2023 - June 2024	\$767,880	\$95.00	\$135.00



### **Two Year Option**

<b>Contract Period</b>	<b>Curbside Annual Collection Rate</b>	<b>Solid Waste Disposal Rate Per Ton</b>	<b>Processing Fee Per Ton</b>
July 2023 - June 2024	\$725,220	\$95.00	\$135.00
July 2024 - June 2025	\$768,733	\$100.70	\$143.10

### **Three Year Option**

<b>Contract Period</b>	<b>Curbside Annual Collection Rate</b>	<b>Solid Waste Disposal Rate Per Ton</b>	<b>Processing Fee Per Ton</b>
July 2023 - June 2024	\$699,624	\$95.00	\$135.00
July 2024 - June 2025	\$741,601	\$100.70	\$143.10
July 2025- June 2026	\$786,097	\$106.42	\$151.69

### **Four Year Option**

<b>Contract Period</b>	<b>Curbside Annual Collection Rate</b>	<b>Solid Waste Disposal Rate Per Ton</b>	<b>Processing Fee Per Ton</b>
July 2023 - June 2024	\$699,624	\$95.00	\$135.00
July 2024 - June 2025	\$741,601	\$100.70	\$143.10
July 2025- June 2026	\$786,097	\$106.42	\$151.69
July 2026- June 2027	\$848,985	\$114.93	\$163.83

**Five Year Manual Collection Option**

Contract Period	Curbside Annual Collection Rate	Solid Waste Disposal Rate Per Ton	Processing Fee Per Ton
July 2023 - June 2024	\$699,624	\$95.00	\$135.00
July 2024 - June 2025	\$741,601	\$100.70	\$143.10
July 2025- June 2026	\$786,097	\$106.42	\$151.69
July 2026- June 2027	\$841,124	\$113.87	\$162.31
July 2027- June 2028	\$908,414	\$122.98	\$175.29

**Automated Collection**

**Five Year Automated Collection Option**

Contract Period	Curbside Annual Collection Rate	Solid Waste Disposal Rate Per Ton	Processing Fee Per Ton
July 2023 - June 2024	\$576,000	\$95.00	\$135.00
July 2024 - June 2025	\$610,560	\$100.70	\$143.10
July 2025- June 2026	\$647,194	\$106.42	\$151.69
July 2026- June 2027	\$692,497	\$113.87	\$162.31
July 2027- June 2028	\$747,897	\$122.98	\$175.29

5 Year Manual Collection Rates:			5 Yaer Automated Collection Rates		
<b>FY24</b>	<b>\$699,624</b>		<b>FY24</b>	<b>\$ 576,000</b>	
<b>FY25</b>	<b>\$741,601</b>		<b>FY25</b>	<b>\$ 610,560</b>	
<b>FY26</b>	<b>\$786,097</b>		<b>FY26</b>	<b>\$ 647,194</b>	
<b>FY27</b>	<b>\$841,124</b>		<b>FY27</b>	<b>\$ 692,497</b>	
<b>FY28</b>	<b>\$908,414</b>		<b>FY28</b>	<b>\$ 747,897</b>	
<b>Total</b>	<b>\$3,976,860</b>		<b>Total</b>	<b>\$ 3,274,148</b>	
			<b>Variance</b>	<b>\$702,712</b>	



**Revised Annual Rate Increases for our Five Automated Collection Option**

**Five Year Automated Collection Option**

Contract Period	Curbside Annual Collection Rate	Annual Curbside Rate % Increase	Solid Waste Disposal Rate Per Ton	Annual Disposal Rate % Increase	Processing Fee Per Ton	Annual Processing Rate % Increase
July 2023 - June 2024	\$576,000		\$95.00		\$135.00	
July 2024 - June 2025	\$601,920	4.50%	\$99.28	4.50%	\$140.40	4.00%
July 2025- June 2026	\$629,006	4.50%	\$103.75	4.50%	\$146.02	4.00%
July 2026- June 2027	\$666,740	6.00%	\$109.98	6.00%	\$151.86	4.00%
July 2027- June 2028	\$713,418	7.00%	\$117.68	7.00%	\$157.93	4.00%

The revised offer above is contingent upon the Town accommodating our request on the reduction of the current holiday schedule to the six holidays we had requested.

**Cart Rate Options**

<b>QTY</b>	<b>2600</b>	<b>2600</b>	
<b>Cart Option One</b>	<b>64- Gallon Trash</b>	<b>64 -Gallon Recycling</b>	<b>\$ 290,272</b>
<b>QTY</b>	<b>2600</b>	<b>2600</b>	
<b>Cart Option Two</b>	<b>64- Gallon Trash</b>	<b>96-Gallon Recycling</b>	<b>\$ 308,306</b>
	<b>2800</b>	<b>2800</b>	
<b>Cart Option Three</b>	<b>64- Gallon Trash</b>	<b>64 -Gallon Recycling</b>	<b>\$ 310,996</b>
	<b>2800</b>	<b>2800</b>	
<b>Cart Option Four</b>	<b>64- Gallon Trash</b>	<b>96 -Gallon Recycling</b>	<b>\$ 333,168</b>

We are presenting the above Automated Collection price which is for up to 2,400 units. Any additional request for carts, then the per unit collection price of \$20.00 per home per month would be applicable. So, in other words if only 2300 sign up, the monthly collection prices above would not be reduced. This a minimum price due our fixed costs that need to be covered.



Example: We start this program with 2350 Homes that sign up. Any additional home added up to 2400 will not impact the annual fee. If the new homes that sign up increases to 2450. The Town would be charged and additional \$20 per month times the 50 additional homes, which would be \$1000 per month

I have two quotes from Cascade the Carts for what it will cost the Town to purchase the carts for this roll out. I have a 64 Gallon Cart for Trash. I have provided two cart options for Recycling which are a 64 gallon and a 96 gallon.

The Town would need to store the extra carts at the DPW or a location that works for the Town. Then every time a resident opts into this program you provide them their 2 carts. Then bill them their annual cart fee. The Town would notify us when a new address has been approved.

All Recycling must be placed inside the cart. Any Recycling placed outside the cart will be tagged and left. Any trash left outside the cart, must be placed inside a Town Approved bag. If not, it will be tagged and left behind.

The fee for driver to get out and to collect the Town approved bags will be \$1.00 per bag. We will monitor this through the Monthly Report that Waste Zero will provide for bag sales each month.

The Town of Boxford's current prevailing wage schedule is \$28.19 per hour. We have based our offer upon a PW rate of \$32.00 per hour. We shall either increase or decrease our proposed charges to the Town by \$850 per year for every \$0.10 per hour over the \$32.00 rate. As well as decrease our offer by \$850 per year for every \$0.10 under the \$32.00 rate we based our offer upon.

Should the Town accept any of the three proposed options, the Town would then request new PW rates for the new contract term, no sooner than 90 days of the start of the new contract.

**Town of Boxford 2018 FY23 Bid Results**

		JRM	Waste Management	Casella
Description				
FY23 Solid Waste and SS Collection		\$ 1,063,555	\$ 543,185	\$ 770,000



Contract Changes
------------------

- 1) For manual collect annually each July 1<sup>st</sup> starting on July 1, 2024. The collection price shall increase to account for Certificates of Occupancy permits (CO's) for new RPS issued in the previous calendar year. The annual adjustment shall be calculated by multiplying the number of Co's by \$255.
- 2) The Town of Boxford shall reduce their current holiday schedule to the six main holidays.

New Year's Day, Memorial Day, July 4<sup>th</sup>, Labor Day, Thanksgiving and Christmas.

Contact Information
---------------------

Primary Contact: Roy Boyer

Title: Public Sector Services Representative

Address: Waste Management, 26 Liberty Drive, Londonderry, NH 03053

Cell Phone: 603-726-0587

Email: [rboyer@wm.com](mailto:rboyer@wm.com)

In closing, we believe Waste Management offers the operational expertise and financial strength to remain a valuable partner with the Town.

We look forward to this opportunity to continue to provide excellent service to the Town of Boxford.

Sincerely,  
Waste Management

*Roy Boyer*

Roy A. Boyer  
Public Sector Services Representative

